

BLUE SHIELD OF CALIFORNIA FOUNDATION

California Technology Assessment Forum

June 18, 2008

Sheraton Gateway Hotel Los Angeles International Airport

Summary of Panel Actions

1. Call to Order and Welcome Guests - Ezra Davidson, M.D.
2. Welcome from the Blue Shield of California Foundation – Deborah Schwab, R.N., ANP
3. Voted to approve the minutes from March 5, 2008 CTAF meeting
4. Notification of panel member conflicts of interest – Ezra Davidson, M.D.
5. Technology Assessment Criteria review - Jeffrey A. Tice, M.D.
6. Ten members of the CTAF panel were in attendance. This provided a quorum. The CTAF panel took the following actions:
 - A. Robot-assisted Surgery for Radical Prostatectomy

The following recommendation was put before the CTAF panel for consideration:

- It is recommended that robot-assisted laparoscopic radical prostatectomy (RALP) as a treatment of clinically localized prostate cancer does not meet CTAF Technology Assessment Criteria 3 through 5 for safety, effectiveness and improvement in health outcomes.

Following Panel discussion and expert testimony, a motion was made by the CTAF Panel Discussion Leader to approve the recommendation as presented. The motion was seconded.

A revised recommendation was presented by the Vice-Chair:

- RALP is a technical modification of a surgical approach (LRP), which in non-randomized, comparative studies appears to provide outcomes no worse, and in many cases superior to both LRP and ORP. In experienced hands the addition of robotic modification extends the visualization and access to precise, laparoscopic tumor removal. Neither ORP nor LRP meet CTAF criteria; nor does RALP satisfy CTAF criteria as a stand-alone, new technology. Regarded as a technical modification of LRP, the panel regards RALP as a promising advance in the management of operable prostatic cancer.

This revised recommendation did not receive a second and therefore failed.

The CTAF Panel then returned to the original recommendation and voted unanimously to approve the following:

- It is recommended that robot-assisted laparoscopic radical prostatectomy as a treatment of clinically localized prostate cancer does not meet CTAF Technology Assessment Criteria 3 through 5 for safety, effectiveness and improvement in health outcomes.

B. Stereotactic Body Radiation Therapy for the Treatment of Early Stage non Small Cell Lung Cancer

(There was a change in agenda order to accommodate two panel members delayed due to flight cancellations.)

The following recommendation was put before the CTAF panel for consideration:

- It is recommended that stereotactic body radiation therapy for the treatment of early stage lung cancer in medically inoperable patients does not meet CTAF Technology Assessment Criteria 2 through 5 for safety, effectiveness and improvement in health outcomes.

Following Panel discussion and expert testimony, a motion was made by the CTAF Panel Discussion Leader to approve the recommendation as presented. The motion was seconded.

The CTAF panel Chair then proposed the following alternate recommendation:

- In medically inoperable patients with early stage non-small cell lung cancer the evidence for SBRT is sufficient for peripheral lesions. These cases have few options and the current evidence suggests SBRT is better than conventional XRT.

This alternate recommendation was seconded and the CTAF panel voted six in favor and four opposed to accept this alternate recommendation.

C. Use of Bevacizumab (Avastin) in the Treatment of Metastatic Breast Cancer

The following recommendation was put before the CTAF panel for consideration:

- It is recommended that the use of bevacizumab as initial or second-line treatment for metastatic breast cancer does not meet CTAF Technology Assessment Criteria 3 through 5 for safety, efficacy and improvement in health outcomes.

Following Panel discussion and expert testimony, a motion was made by the CTAF Panel Discussion Leader to accept the recommendation as presented. The motion was seconded.

The CTAF Panel voted nine in favor of this recommendation with one abstention.

D. Percutaneous Laser Disc Decompression for Treatment of Lumbar Disc Prolapse

The following recommendation was put before the CTAF panel for consideration:

- It is recommended that percutaneous laser disc decompression (laser discectomy) for the treatment of symptomatic lumbar disc prolapse does not meet CTAF Technology Assessment criteria 2-5 for safety, efficacy and improvement in health outcomes.

Following Panel discussion a motion was made by the CTAF Panel Discussion leader to approve the recommendation as presented. This motion was seconded.

The CTAF panel voted unanimously in favor of this recommendation.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:15 P.M. The next meeting of the California Technology Assessment Forum will be held on October 15, 2008 at the Mission Bay Conference Center at UCSF, San Francisco, CA.